

Sex Trafficking in Southeast Asia: the Need for a Victim-Centered Perspective

Jenna Maack, J.D.
Attorney at Law
Spring 2008

I. INTRODUCTION

The complexity of our globalized modern world calls for a truly integrated approach to the widespread and under-detected problem of human sex trafficking – the modern day slavery. This paper examines the current legal framework using Cambodia and Thailand as case studies. Trafficking is a widespread human rights issue that cannot be alleviated successfully when approached in the current fragmented way. Thus, this proposal argues that the solution to the global problem of trafficking must fully incorporate the perspective of the human rights of the victims into the current law enforcement framework; each framework can mutually enhance the effectiveness of the other. This study will first discuss the nature of the trafficking problem in Southeast Asia, along with the reasons why trafficking is so widespread, under-detected and under-prosecuted. Next it will analyze prospective changes in the legal framework while working within both the major law enforcement treaty on trafficking and important human rights treaties focusing on women and children. Additionally, it will argue that the unique issues confronted by Cambodia as a “supply state” versus Thailand as a “demand state” call for distinct solutions. Supply countries, such as Cambodia, must focus on educating women and children (of their human rights, the trafficking process, and generally with adequate schooling); working towards gender equality within their society; reducing poverty (by way of education, job training and loan programs); and

developing workable bilateral and multilateral agreements with neighboring countries (to prevent trafficking across borders and to reintegrate victims). Whereas demand countries, such as Thailand, must focus on training law enforcement (especially to recognize victims and integrate a human rights perspective); develop a refugee program that protects the human rights of refugees and displaced persons; and de-criminalize and regulate prostitution. These specific solutions will demonstrate the advantage of a more victim-centered human rights approach to the trafficking problem.

II. NATURE OF THE HUMAN TRAFFICKING PROBLEM

The focus of this paper is the international trafficking of women and children for the purposes of sexual exploitation (e.g., prostitution, pornography, forced marriage, etc.). This problem is especially complex and, sadly, internationally widespread in the age of globalization. Unfortunately, the illegal sex trade is also on the rise: trafficking in all forms of organized sex-trade rose a shocking 50 percent from 1995 to 2000. Researchers commonly refer to it as the “modern day slavery” or “sex-trade industry”; indeed, more people are exploited in modern day slavery than there were slaves taken from Africa during the Old World slavery. “200 years after the end of the trans-Atlantic slave trade we have the obligation to fight a crime that has no place in the 21st century,” said Antonio Maria Costa, Head of the U.N. office on Drugs and Crime.¹ Fortunately, in the past decade international awareness of this global problem is also on the rise. This paper will analyze the problem and the potential solutions with a focus on the region of Southeast Asia, where more women and children are trafficked than in any other area of the world (80 percent of trafficking victims are women and girls, the majority of whom

¹ *Human Trafficking: A Crime that Shames Us All*, Vienna Forum to Fight Human Trafficking (February 13, 2008), <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/about-unodc/speeches/2008-02-13.html>.

are victims from Asian countries²). Often victims are forced to have sex with men hundreds of times, without pay, for years. They usually cannot leave the brothel, have limited or no medical care, and often no access to condoms.³

Global trafficking in humans is an organized multi-billion dollar industry, second only to drug and arms trafficking. But unlike drugs and guns, these criminal organizations operate with impunity and near immunity – they are rarely apprehended and prosecuted in most legal jurisdictions. Sadly, it is far more likely for a criminal to be prosecuted in Southeast Asia for selling illegally copied DVDs than for selling a child into prostitution against her will. While all Southeast Asian countries have made trafficking illegal (discussed *infra*), this prohibition is rarely enforced primarily for the following reasons: culturally ingrained attitudes about women; porous borders; the difficulty detecting traffickers; and the fact that sex trafficking is such a lucrative enterprise, often involving corruption of law enforcement officials.⁴ In order to arrive at a solution, the root causes of this problem must be identified, and the steps that have been

² Calvin C. Cheung, *Protecting Sex Trafficking Victims: Establishing the Persecution Element*, 14 Asian Am. L.J. 31, 32 (2007) (discussing how difficult it is for trafficking victims in the United States to receive a “T-Visa” due to the requirement that they must testify against their captors). See also, Abigail Schwartz, *Sex Trafficking in Cambodia*, 17 Colum. J. Asian. L. 371, 380 (2004) (thirty percent of the prostitutes found in Cambodia are between the ages of twelve and seventeen.)

³ See Abigail Schwartz, *Sex Trafficking in Cambodia*, 17 Colum. J. Asian. L. 371, 419 (2004).

· Susan W. Tiefenbrun, *Updating the Domestic and International Impact of the U.S. Victims of Trafficking Protection Act of 2000: Does Law Deter Crime?*, 38 Case W. Res. J. Int’l L. 249, 250. (“Trafficking has become one of the fastest growing and most lucrative industries earning as much as seven to ten billion dollars annually for traffickers and international crime syndicates. A sex trafficker or brothel owner can earn from three to ten thousand dollars for each woman lured into forced prostitution or sex slavery. The trafficking of women is the third most profitable crime next to the traffic of weapons and the traffic of drugs. However, since women can be reused and resold more easily than needles, the traffic in women may soon rise to the level of the second most lucrative international crime.”)

⁴ Jason Chan, *Decriminalization of Prostitution in China*, 3 New Eng. J. Int’l & Comp. L. 329, 338 (arguing that the deplorable treatment of trafficking victims by Chinese law enforcement is due to China’s criminalization of prostitution; the best way to protect these victim’s human rights, Chan argues, is by decriminalizing and regulating prostitution in China).

taken rigorously evaluated to examine how they have improved or worsened the situation.

A. Analysis of Causes

The root causes of sex trafficking in Southeast Asia are twofold: (1) pervasive poverty, and (2) the cultural and historical status of women and girls as second-class citizens⁵. Flowing from these root causes are a plethora of consequential conditions that have allowed human trafficking to flourish. Although the socio-cultural conditions are complex, it is crucial to identify key problems areas in order to examine effective potential remedies and developing legal approaches. Briefly summarized, the consequential conditions of the root causes that enable sex-trafficking are: (1) lack of education among women and children; (2) culturally entrenched second class status of these groups; (3) involuntary and forced sex-slavery is entangled under laws for prostitution in general (need to recognize their distinct human rights issues) and therefore criminalizing the victims; (4) huge profits are generated by human sex trafficking organized crime syndicates; and (5) economic desperation and unemployment (lack of economic options in conditions of poverty) exacerbate the vulnerability of these groups to exploitation by sex-traffickers. Legislators and law enforcement are empowered to re-focus energies on prosecuting the actual criminal networks after clearly examining these conditions and recognizing the human rights of victims in the sex trade industry. Laws and treaties recognizing the human rights issues should generally separate the victims of sex trafficking (even protecting them) from the traffickers and criminal activity, in order

⁵ See generally, Christa Foster Crawford, *Culture, Economic and Legal Factors Underlying Trafficking in Thailand and Their Impact on Women and Girls*, 12 *Cardozo J.L. & Gender* 821 (2006); Schwartz, *supra* note 3, at 419.

to concentrate legal and law-enforcement resources upon those who perpetrate international human sex trafficking.

This “two-pronged approach” (human rights factors affecting legal focus) is a sound basis for international law agreements and for local law enforcement agreements. The human rights conditions influencing the expansion of criminal sex trafficking must be recognized and addressed for effective legal action, however this is currently an area of weakness in the international protocol (discussed below). The conditions forming a substantial foundation for regarding the human rights of the victims of sex trafficking, as outlined above, provide a background for examining the treaties and laws in this analysis, and support the need to include substantial human rights components in the development of laws and implementation.

The following overview of these conditions gives perspective to addressing the trenchant transnational social problems and legal conundrum faced by these nations in order to then examine the current development of laws and treaties. First, due to the widespread poverty in Southeast Asia, women and children lack education, causing vulnerability to economic hardship and exploitation. Without education and skills to find suitable work, women and children are susceptible to being lured into situations in which they find themselves in another country with no passport or visa and forced into sexual slavery. Generally, these women were promised jobs that would pay well, believing they could then take care of themselves and their families. Alternatively, some families end up selling their children into slavery because the families are destitute. Typically,

undereducated and desperate social groups are uninformed about the methods and ruses that organized traffickers employ to entice their victims.⁶

Second, the cultural and historical second-class citizen status of women and children has allowed sexual exploitation to expand as socially accepted conditions within larger socio-cultural structures. Because women and children are not viewed on an equal platform with men, their human rights are not fully recognized within their own societies and cultures. Prostitution is often viewed as completely acceptable or normative as a pervasive social phenomenon, and not as a violation of human rights (in the case of involuntary sex workers).⁷ The complex social dynamics of prostitution result in both voluntary and involuntary prostitution but are not viewed separately from a legal perspective. When women and children are forced into sexual slavery they fall under the same laws regarding professional prostitution, rather than recognizing that involuntary sexual-slavery is a violation of their innate human rights.⁸

Prostitution may commonly be outlawed in most countries and can be prosecuted as a crime within national legal systems, but the victims of involuntary sex-slavery are frequently treated as criminals while organized sex-traffickers often escape punishment.⁹ The traffickers are often organized in criminal syndicates similar to drug trafficking

⁶ See generally Chan, *supra* note 4; Elizabeth M. Bruch, *Models Wanted: The Search for an Effective Response to Human Trafficking*, 40 Stan. J. Int'l L. 1 (2004) (discussing poverty and lack of education generally and their effect on trafficking).

⁷ See Crawford, *supra* note 5, at 828-29.

⁸ Chan, *supra* note 4, at 334 (describing one situation where “40 mainland (China) women suspected of prostitution [were] rounded up, interned in a crowded 12 square metre cage, in much the same way as animals would be. The women were in public view for over thirteen hours and press photos showed the forty women helplessly lying on the ground in a cell with no toilet facilities, no privacy, no food, and male officers standing by.” No distinction was made between forced and voluntary prostitutes).

⁹ Chan, *supra* note 4, at 329 (prostitution illegal in China); Crawford, *supra* note 5, at 829 (prostitution illegal in Thailand; however, law goes largely un-enforced); Law on the Suppression of Kidnapping, Trafficking and Exploitation of Humans (2006), Cambodian Defenders' Project website, http://www.cdpcambodia.org/trafficking_law.asp (last visited May 13, 2008) (prostitution illegal in Cambodia).

rings, and are rarely apprehended or prosecuted. Moreover, corrupt law enforcement officials in many countries may actively participate in perpetrating sexual slavery by accepting bribes and profits, rather than pursuing and prosecuting organized crime syndicates.¹⁰ Crime syndicates wield power at the local level through financially corrupting officials and threatening violence or other coercive tactics.

In this dangerous subculture where the victims are treated as criminals, sex-slaves also fear coming forward to law enforcement because they are threatened by the traffickers, feeling helpless to resist their slave-masters in the face of threatening consequences.¹¹ If law enforcement does step in to deal with the problem, victims fear being treated as criminals participating in prostitution and/or as illegal immigrants. These exploited victims inevitably suffer helpless desperation in violation of their human rights when seeking liberation from slavery: fearing immigration officials, legal systems, criminal organizations, and prospects of poverty.

Another condition emerging from the discrimination against women is that cultural acceptance of the sex-trade industry generates a huge market, both internationally and locally, for prostitution, pornography, sex-slavery and forced marriage to thrive in Southeast Asia. This market-demand for prostitutes, whether voluntary or involuntary, has allowed traffickers to make billions of dollars in profits at the cost of shattering millions of victim's lives. Many of the men who purchase sex, strip dances, and other sexual favors are not even aware that often these women are being forced into this kind of work against their will. Organized sex traffickers work in the shadows behind the complex web of socially accepted and illegal prostitution. A distinction must be made

¹⁰ See e.g., Schwartz, *supra* note 3, at 429.

¹¹ *Id.*

between voluntary prostitution and the sex-slave trade. The widespread acceptance of prostitution combined with culturally accepted attitudes subordinating females creates a smokescreen obscuring a reality that many victims were forced into slavery. These cultural factors contributing to expansion of sexual trafficking of women and children continues to grow, while traffickers continue to profit with little risk of prosecution because they can hide behind a socially accepted industry that does not distinguish sex-slaves as a separate group.

Yet another issue arises from the second-class status of women and girls: schooling and job opportunities in the region of Southeast Asia are sometimes extremely limited. Jobs that pay well are generally given to men, and girls rarely get educational training on par with their male counterparts. Families struggling with poverty may sacrifice children to denigrating sources of income, putting many young women at risk of taking offers for “voluntary” and “involuntary” prostitution. However, human rights scholars¹² are wary of using the term “voluntary,” because (1) they are economically desperate for any employment and (2) they are usually lured with promises of a good paying job into a bonded worker situation where it takes years to pay off their “debt” to the traffickers or brothel owners. As noted in the Trafficking in Persons report: “Few women seek out or choose to be in prostitution, and most are desperate to leave it. A 2003 scientific study in the *Journal of Trauma Practice* found that 89 percent of women in prostitution want to escape prostitution but had no other options for survival.”¹³

¹² Schwartz, *supra* note 3, at 394.

¹³ Trafficking in Persons Report, released by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons June 12, 2007, <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2007/82809.htm>.

III. LEGAL FRAMEWORK

This form of modern day human slavery can be defined from several intersecting perspectives: as a legal problem; a human rights problem; a moral issue; a gender issue; a child labor problem; a migration problem; a public health issue; and a multi-national crime problem. Many different United Nations organizations have approached human trafficking from one or more of these perspectives, and have hence posited different solutions. Regardless of which perspective is chosen, it is important to look at the issue in terms of both market demand and market supply because any effective solution must take into account both factors. All of these views are important to a helpful analysis of the issue; however, this paper will focus more specifically on attacking the trafficking problem from both the law-enforcement oriented framework and from a women and children's [i.e., the victims] rights perspective. Finally, this paper contends that a collaboration and integration of the victim's rights perspective within the law enforcement framework will effectuate the most promising solution to the trafficking problem in Southeast Asia.

A. Interplay of International Treaties

International treaties play a substantial critical role in addressing human trafficking, but they often require stronger emphasis on international human rights law in order to be more effective. One crucial document for contextual analysis regarding the treatment of trafficking for the purposes of sex is The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime ("Trafficking

Protocol”).¹⁴ However, because the Trafficking Protocol does not have a strong focus on victim’s human rights, other relevant treaties focusing on human rights are essential to develop, explore and arrive at a multi-faceted solution to combat trafficking. Hence, this paper explores solutions from a law enforcement perspective using the Trafficking Protocol but also incorporating a victim’s human rights centered perspective in the context of two major treaties: the U.N. Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women¹⁵ (“CEDAW”) and the U.N. Convention of the Rights of the Child (“CRC”).¹⁶ CEDAW, adopted in 1979 by the U.N. General Assembly, is the first international bill of rights for women. CEDAW contains provisions calling for suppression of the exploitation and trafficking of women (discussed more fully below).¹⁷ The CRC, adopted in 1989, also contains specific provisions requiring states to protect children from trafficking and sexual exploitation.¹⁸ However, even with the advent of CEDAW and CRC, global trafficking in women and children escalated. In response to this pervasive problem, the international community took a powerful law enforcement approach and combined it with articles asking states to provide protection and assistance for victims.

¹⁴ Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, G.A. Res. 25, annex II, U.N. GAOR, 55th Sess., Supp. No. 49, at 60, U.N. Doc. A/45/49 (Vol. I) (2001), *entered into force* Sept. 9, 2003 [hereinafter Trafficking Protocol].

¹⁵ Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1919, <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/cedaw.htm> (last visited May 13, 2008) [hereinafter CEDAW].

¹⁶ Convention on the Rights of the Child, November 20, 1989, <http://www.unhcr.ch/html/menu3/b/k2crc.htm> (last visited May 13, 2008) [hereinafter CRC].

¹⁷ CEDAW, *supra* note 15, Article 6

¹⁸ CRC, *supra* note 16, Article 34

i. The Trafficking Protocol¹⁹

The Trafficking Protocol, entered into force in 2001, was developed within the UN Crime Commission as a reaction to the dramatic rise in trafficking across the globe; as such, it contains strong law enforcement language.²⁰ While the Trafficking Protocol is an important step taken by the international community to combat trafficking from a law enforcement perspective, it contains comparatively weak human rights language. For instance, the language calling upon states to implement law enforcement procedures use “state parties *shall*,” while victim assistance and protection articles use weaker language such as “in appropriate cases.”²¹

The Trafficking Protocol has fourteen substantive articles that clearly define trafficking. “Trafficking in persons” is defined as:

the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.²²

The protocol places importance on international cooperation, asking states to criminalize and prosecute trafficking, protect and assist victims, and adopt preventative measures.²³ Hence, the protocol takes a three-tiered approach to trafficking: prosecution, protection, and prevention. Additionally, countries can go beyond the Protocol and devise more specific measures that address the particulars of the trafficking situation

¹⁹ The Trafficking Protocol has 117 signatories and 108 members, including Thailand and Cambodia. *See*, www.un-instraw.org/revista/hypermail/alltickers/en/0704.html (last visited May 12, 2008).

²⁰ Ann D. Jordan, *Annotated Guide to the Complete Trafficking Protocol*, www.globalrights.org/site/DocServer/Annotated_Protocol.pdf?docID=2723 (last visited May 12, 2008).

²¹ Trafficking Protocol, *supra* note 14, *see e.g.*, Articles 5 and 6 (emphasis added).

²² *Id.*, Article 3 (a).

²³ *Id.*, Articles 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9.

occurring within and outside their borders. This is useful considering supply states may need to address their trafficking problem from a somewhat different legal framework than demand states. Of particular importance is Article 3 (b) making consent of the victim irrelevant for purposes of prosecution when a trafficker employs any of the above methods. This allows the protocol to work equally well in states regardless of whether a particular state criminalizes or legalizes prostitution. In both states a trafficker can be prosecuted when using force, fraud, etc., even if the victim “consented.” Additionally, Article 3(c) of the UN Trafficking Protocol specifically defines child trafficking as the recruitment, transportation, transfer, and harboring of a minor for the purpose of exploitation, even if none of the means set forth in Article 3(a) are used.²⁴

A major benefit of the law enforcement focus adopted by the Trafficking Protocol is that it seeks to prosecute traffickers directly.²⁵ Not only does this overcome the traditional difficulties posed by a state attempting to prosecute international laws, it also raises awareness to the seriousness of the issue.²⁶ A tough law enforcement perspective also means that potential future traffickers will be deterred.

Additionally, a human rights perspective is found in the Recommended Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking, a “soft law” instrument used by the new Special Rapporteur, which focuses on protection and assistance to victims.²⁷

ii. CEDAW in the Context of Trafficking

CEDAW is the first major international human rights treaty focused specifically on the treatment of women, and the first to address trafficking from a human rights

²⁴ *Id.*, Article 3 (c).

²⁵ Bruch, *supra* note 6, at 17.

²⁶ *Id.*

²⁷ Silva Scarpa, *Child Trafficking: International Instruments to Protect the Most Vulnerable Victims*, 44 *Fam. Ct. Rev.* 429, 437 (2006).

perspective.²⁸ Article 6 provides: “States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.”²⁹ This provision is relatively weak, as it does not define trafficking and arguably may conflate trafficking with prostitution.³⁰ Because none of the anti-trafficking treaties have created a “treaty-based body to monitor compliance or hear complaints,”³¹ the most active work in monitoring trafficking against women has been done by the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women.³² Hence, the human rights framework considers trafficking mostly from the perspective of violence against women.

iii. CRC in the Context of Trafficking

The CRC is the main human rights treaty dealing with the trafficking of children³³; it requires all states parties to “take measures to combat the illicit transfer and non-return of children abroad.”³⁴ It also provides that state parties take measures to protect children from economic, sexual and any other form of exploitation.³⁵ It further requires states parties “take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form.”³⁶ State parties are required to submit progress reports to the Committee on the

²⁸ *Id.* at 29.

²⁹ CEDAW, *supra* note 13, Article 6.

³⁰ See Bruch, *supra* note 6, at 29 (arguing weakness in human rights framework in part because trafficking has not been viewed as either a “mainstream” human rights issue or as women’s rights issue.) .

³¹ *Id.*

³² *Id.* (the Special Rapporteur’s mandate comes from the Commission on Human Rights).

³³ The CRC is the most ratified treaty in the world; interestingly, only the United States and Somalia have not ratified the CRC. See <http://www.unhchr.ch/pdf/report.pdf> (listing status of all countries regarding the major international treaties).

³⁴ CRC, *supra* note 16, Article 11 (1).

³⁵ *Id.*, Articles 32, 34, and 36.

³⁶ *Id.*, Article 35.

Rights of the Child. The Committee has emphasized the need to fight child trafficking many times in its recommendations and observations.³⁷

IV. CASE STUDIES IN TRAFFICKING: CAMBODIA & THAILAND

A. Crossing Borders: the Reciprocal Nature of Sex Trafficking between Southeast Asian Countries.

To illustrate the common pattern of trafficking between Southeast Asian countries, this paper focuses specifically on Cambodia and Thailand as examples of a “supply state” and a “demand state.” However, it is important to note that this pattern is common throughout Southeast Asian countries in general as well as other regions around the world. Thailand and Cambodia are useful case studies because they are illustrative of the trafficking problem between relatively wealthy and relatively poor bordering nations. Thailand’s relative wealth compared to the poverty of its neighbors, such as Cambodia and Myanmar (Burma), has made it an attractive place for international and national sex tourism.³⁸ Because demand for sexual services in Thailand is thus quite high, traffickers lure their victims from much poorer neighboring states.³⁹ Thus, states like Cambodia and Myanmar provide a supply of very poor and susceptible women and children who are frequently lured into Thailand’s sex trade against their will. The interplay between supply and demand states is important to the legal analysis of the trafficking problem because an effective solution must take into account both sides of the same problem.

B. Cambodia’s Trafficking Problem: Problems & Recommendations

Supply countries, such as Cambodia, must focus on educating women and children (of their human rights, the trafficking process, and generally with adequate

³⁷ Scarpa, *supra* note 27, at 439.

³⁸ See Crawford, *supra* note 5.

³⁹ See generally, *Id.*; Schwartz, *supra* note 3; www.humantrafficking.org/countries/cambodia.

schooling); working towards gender equality within their society; reducing poverty (by way of education, job training and loan programs); and developing effective bilateral and multilateral agreements with neighboring countries (to prevent trafficking across borders and to reintegrate victims).

A brief overview of the particular issues facing Cambodia, along with some of the developments concerning trafficking are set forth here as an essential backdrop to legal analysis. Cambodia is a signatory to CEDAW, CRC, and the Trafficking Protocol; human sex trafficking violates the provisions of these treaties discussed *supra*. The Cambodian Constitution and a national Anti-Trafficking law enacted in 1996 clearly prohibit sex trafficking.⁴⁰ However, there are problems with the legal system, the legislative body, and the police force which – when combined with poverty and the ingrained cultural gender bias against women – result in widespread trafficking of women and children.⁴¹

Legal problems caused by incoherent laws, especially regarding the legal age of a child to consent to sexual intercourse, is also an issue.⁴² While the Trafficking Protocol and the CRC define the age of majority as eighteen, Cambodia law allows a girl to

⁴⁰ Law on the Suppression of Kidnapping, Trafficking and Exploitation of Humans (2006). Available at Cambodian Defenders' Project website, at http://www.cdpcambodia.org/trafficking_law.asp (last visited May 13, 2008).

⁴¹ Schwartz, *supra* note 3, at 408 (discussing Cambodia's trafficking problem and concluding that, while Cambodia's national anti-trafficking laws are adequate, enforcement along with protection of and assistance to victims is lacking).

⁴² *Id.*

consent to marriage at age fifteen⁴³. Moreover, due to the recent political violence in Cambodia under the Pol Pot regime, the judicial system was left essentially broken as many lawyers and judges were killed.⁴⁴ Hence, currently there are few judges and lawyers in Cambodia; overall these legal professionals are poorly trained, especially regarding women and children's rights as expressed in CEDAW and the CRC.

Additionally, the judicial system is backlogged and plagued with corrupt officials.⁴⁵ Cambodia must strive to rebuild a workable judicial system to enforce its anti-trafficking laws.

Furthermore, gender discrimination is widespread and as a result women are under-educated and unqualified for positions of power in the community. For example, women have a small voice in the government: 7.4% of the National Assembly and 13.7% of the Senate are comprised of women, despite women making up 60% of overall population.⁴⁶

Despite these difficult hurdles, NGOs have made important steps to combat trafficking in Cambodia. For example, they have trained police forces to combat trafficking and lawyers to prosecute cases.⁴⁷ They have also launched important

⁴³ *Id.*

⁴⁴ *Id.*

⁴⁵ *Id.* at 419; *see also* <http://www.humantrafficking.org> ("Web Resource for Combating Human Trafficking"; "The HumanTrafficking.org project is being implemented by the Academy for Educational Development with funding provided by the U.S. State Department." Statistics from this Web Resource provide additional information for this paper, as noted, and include material agreed upon by the "The Asian Regional Initiative Against Trafficking (ARIAT) in Women and Children," conference, held in Manila in March 2000. The meeting was co-hosted by the governments of the United States of America and the Philippines. See especially <<http://www.humantrafficking.org/countries/cambodia> > for overview of trafficking in Cambodia.

⁴⁶ Trafficking of Cambodian Women and Children, Report of the Fact Finding in Malaysia, Cambodian Women's Crisis Center, August 2005, <http://www.cwcc.org.kh/downloads/TRAFFICKING%20OF%20CAMBODIAN%20WOMEN%20AND%20CHILDREN.pdf>.

⁴⁷ Schwartz, *supra* note 3, at 422.

awareness raising campaigns to reach Cambodians through posters, radio shows, television ads, and victim's shelters.⁴⁸

The most successful way to effect change (especially in a supply country) will be to educate and empower women. This will greatly reduce the supply of susceptible women and girls. This can be done through awareness raising campaigns, funding for schools, and low interest credit programs allowing women to join together and start a business. The international community must shift its central focus in the fight against human trafficking onto the human rights of the victim. This will enhance the already strong law enforcement framework established by the Trafficking Protocol. A victim oriented approach would envision the trafficking process from the experience of the victim, and is helpful as a tool to educate women and children in supply countries.

The complexity of sex trafficking, therefore, requires analysis of components or steps in the process of addressing international human rights of the victims. A helpful "person-centered" framework has been developed called the "Bangladesh Matrix," which facilitates an understanding of the process and the steps each state needs to take in order to both combat trafficking and ensure human rights are protected.⁴⁹ The steps go from before a person is trafficked to after law enforcement has stepped in: (1) prevention; (2) migration; (3) demand; (4) trafficking harm; (5) recovery; (6) integration; (7) repatriation; (8) prosecution.⁵⁰ NGOs have created posters depicting this cycle in order to inform women of the process and their rights. This matrix is illustrative, because at each

⁴⁸ *Id.*; see also, www.humantrafficking.org/countries/cambodia

⁴⁹ Nancie Caraway, *Human Rights and Existing Contradictions in Asia-Pacific Human Trafficking Politics and Discourse*, 14 Tul. J. Int'l & Comp. L. 295, 313 (2006) ("The matrix has considerable value in enabling people to visualize the complexities of trafficking and thus exposing the inadequacies of responses that do not consider the full range of complexities. An important difference between this framework and others is that it is "person-centered.").

⁵⁰ *Id.*

step there is an opportunity to take legal action to curb this cycle and ultimately stop human trafficking. An example of this “integrated” approach incorporating a “person oriented” human rights framework is articulated by the recommendations of the The Asian Regional Initiative Against Trafficking (ARIAT) in Women and Children, convening in Manila, Philippines, in 2000.⁵¹ The “ARIAT Action Plan” describes and indicates at least twelve steps to combat human trafficking in Southeast Asia. An illustration of their emphasis on the victims may be found in their conclusion that cooperative agreements should focus on “providing comprehensive and immediate assistance for trafficked persons including victim safety and assistance, social services, and reintegration efforts.”⁵² For example, under the first step (prevention), NGOs have developed positive and helpful awareness raising campaigns. This educational approach would benefit Cambodia.

Thus, in the human rights/person centered approach, we can identify steps that need to be taken in each area. Prevention is an extremely important area of concern. If we can prevent trafficking by deterring traffickers, educating women and children, raising awareness of the problem, and regulating the sex market, we can eliminate much of the problem. Laudable efforts have been made by U.N. organizations, NGOs, and activists over the past decade in raising awareness of the issue. For example, in February of this year, the U.N. held its first ever large scale conference on human trafficking, with over 1000 participants from over 100 nations attending, including celebrities and artists.⁵³

⁵¹ The conference and 12-point action plan are described at <http://www.humantrafficking.org/events/88> (last accessed May 13, 2008).

⁵² Caraway, *supra* note 56, at 313.

⁵³ “UN Forum Aims to End Trafficking,” BBC news, <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/7242180.stm> (last visited May 13, 2008).

NGOs have also been successful protesting in Western countries to help deter Western men from soliciting sex abroad.⁵⁴

On a separate front, multilateral and bilateral agreements, urged by the Trafficking Protocol, the CEDAW and the CRC (as discussed *supra*) are another important way to combat trafficking between neighboring countries. These regionalized agreements have the advantage of addressing the particularities and uniqueness of the trafficking problem amongst two or several neighboring states. Notably, Cambodia and Thailand signed an important extradition and repatriation agreement in a cooperative effort to repatriate trafficked Cambodian children⁵⁵; about 200 trafficked children per week were returned to be repatriated and reintegrated. However, only six or seven offenders were convicted of the crime.⁵⁶ Cambodia also signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Thailand in 2003 to combat trafficking by pursuing joint investigations.⁵⁷ The CRC, as noted above, obliges states to make bilateral and multilateral agreements such as this.

Thus, Cambodia has made some efforts to eliminate trafficking of women and children. But lack of funding, staff and proper training remain an obstacle to state remedial action. Official corruption continues to hamper these efforts. In 2003, the police force initiated 415 investigations against child sex, trafficking, and pornography; police raided twenty-five suspected traffickers in Phnom Penh and arrested thirty-three suspected traffickers.⁵⁸ This effort resulted in the rescue of fifty-four trafficking

⁵⁴ www.humantrafficking.org/countries/cambodia (last visited May 13, 2008).

⁵⁵ *Id.*

⁵⁶ *Id.*

⁵⁷ *Id.*

⁵⁸ *Id.*

victims.⁵⁹ Also, in 2006, several state officials were convicted of trafficking related bribery charges and sentenced to prison.⁶⁰ Thus, Cambodia is making some progress.

Trafficking of Cambodian women and children is not limited to Thailand; many Cambodians are trafficked to Singapore and Malaysia, where they are often arrested and put into detention camps with no access to lawyers.⁶¹ They are criminalized as illegal immigrants instead of treated as victims. This problem is exacerbated by the Cambodian Embassy, whose officials do not visit the prisons and detention camps, thus making return home and repatriation very difficult for victims.⁶² This situation can be improved if law enforcement is not only trained in enforcing local and international laws pursuant to the Trafficking Protocol, but also trained to distinguish victims from voluntary prostitutes. When victims are recognized as such, a human rights perspective will facilitate the proper recovery and assistance that these victims deserve under the recommendations in the Trafficking Protocol. Furthermore, law enforcement and prosecutors should be trained to investigate and prosecute cases without the testimony of the victim, as urged (but not required) by the Trafficking Protocol.

Cambodia has very recently taken a great legal step in the fight against trafficking. In 2007, the Cambodian National Assembly unanimously approved a new law on anti-human trafficking and sexual exploitation:

‘This law is one of the first steps of reforming the judicial and court system of the country’, Ang Vong Vattana, Cambodian Minister of Justice, told the National Assembly after it approved the law. It also helped to strengthen the rule of law and reduce poverty in the kingdom, he

⁵⁹ *Id.*

⁶⁰ *Id.*

⁶¹ Trafficking of Cambodian Women and Children, Report of the Fact Finding in Malaysia, Cambodian Women’s Crisis Center, August 2005, <http://www.cwcc.org.kh/downloads/TRAFFICKING%20OF%20CAMBODIAN%20WOMEN%20AND%20CHILDREN.pdf>

⁶² *Id.*

said, adding that the law will be exercised strictly. Cambodia passed its old law on anti-human trafficking and sexual exploitation with 10 articles in 1996. The new law has 52 articles and contains more details than the previous one. According to the new law, relevant criminals could be sentenced to 20 years in jail and fined up to 2,500 U.S. dollars.⁶³

This law is a serious step in the right direction from a law enforcement perspective; however, Cambodia still needs to incorporate a human rights approach into their practical application of their anti-trafficking laws. Thus, without the inclusion of a victim-centered approach, victims will have little or no redress either domestically or internationally.⁶⁴ A regional human rights court for Southeast Asia would also be an important way to hold state officials accountable for their participation in aiding and abetting traffickers, and also could allow for civil remedies for victims.

C. Thailand's Trafficking Problem: Problems & Recommendations

Demand countries, such as Thailand, must focus on training law enforcement (especially to recognize victims and integrate a human rights perspective); develop a refugee program that protects the human rights of refugees and displaced persons; and de-criminalize and regulate prostitution.

Thailand is also a signatory to CEDAW, CRC and the Trafficking Protocol. And, in the past two decades, Thailand has made great improvements in reducing the supply of Thai women and girls trafficked within and across its borders.⁶⁵ This is mainly a result of NGOs' efforts to educate and heighten economic development in Thailand's indigenous regions. However, the demand side of the problem has not been addressed and remains

⁶³ "Cambodia Approves Law on Anti-Human Trafficking," December, 20 2007, www.chinaview.cn, (last visited March 13, 2008) (the law itself does not seem to be available online as of May 14, 2008).

⁶⁴ Individual victims have no standing in the International Court of Justice and Southeast Asian neighboring states would be reluctant to bring a claim against a neighboring state for trafficking.

⁶⁵ Crawford, *supra* note 5, at 830-31.

high. Furthermore, Thailand has not effectively dealt with the major influx of displaced refugees streaming across the border, mostly from Myanmar.⁶⁶ The result is that most women and girls are trafficking from the surrounding poorer countries, especially Myanmar, but to a lesser extent Cambodia and Laos. A major problem is that Thailand does not recognize the status of refugees within its borders.⁶⁷ As a result, asylum seekers are not distinguished from legal or illegal immigrants. The disastrous human rights abuses committed by the military regime of Myanmar has led to thousands of refugees (primarily women and girls) to flee to Thailand. These women are particularly susceptible to being trafficked into the sex trade because they are legally treated as undocumented aliens. In the case of women and children fleeing from Myanmar, Crawford notes that:

Under Thai immigration law, irregular migrants are subject to arrest, fines and deportation for immigration violations. Violators face months-long detentions in jail-like immigration detention centers until they can pay their way back to Burma. Despite domestic and international laws to the contrary, even victims of trafficking, including underage victims, have been arrested for prostitution and trafficking.⁶⁸

The recent catastrophic cyclone victims will no doubt cause a new surge of vulnerable refugees seeking asylum in Thailand.

Thailand can greatly reduce the suffering of many trafficking victims by developing more humanitarian immigration policies, and by further implementing a

⁶⁶ U.S. COMMITTEE FOR REFUGEES, WORLD REFUGEE SURVEY 2007, *available at* www.refugees.org/countryreports.aspx?id=2024 (Immigration and Refugee Service of America 2007).

⁶⁷ See U.N. Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, July 28, 1951, 189 U.N.T.S. 150. Although Thailand asserts that they abide by the Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees in practice, in 2007 Thailand was host to more than 400,000 refugees and displaced persons. Refugees are routinely arrested by police and forced to choose between deportation or unspecified lengths of detention. U.S. COMMITTEE FOR REFUGEES, WORLD REFUGEE SURVEY 2007, *available at* www.refugees.org/countryreports.aspx?id=2024 (Immigration and Refugee Service of America 2007).

⁶⁸ Crawford, *supra* note 5, at 846.

training program so that border guards can identify refugees and trafficking victims from illegal immigrants, and focus on the human rights of the victim. Effective regional cooperative agreements between Thailand and its neighbor states would further reduce the suffering of victims trafficked across the Thai border⁶⁹. These victims need assistance to either return to their homes or (in the case of many refugees from Myanmar) relocate and find suitable employment. The current policy of forcing these victims to choose between immediate deportation (at the victim's expense) and arbitrary detention⁷⁰ sadly adds to the human rights abuses these victims have already suffered.

Prostitution is also de jure illegal in Thailand⁷¹; however, prostitution is so deeply ingrained in the socio-economic structure of Thailand that this law is rarely enforced. Because of the second-class status of women and the power of men to subjugate women, the perpetrators of sex trafficking often act with impunity and the sex industry victims fall prey to corrupt law enforcement prosecution of the laws. Hence, for all practical purposes prostitution is de-facto legal in Thailand, and yet it goes unregulated, resulting in the widespread un-detection of trafficked women and children.

⁶⁹ A 2003 MOU between Thailand, Cambodia, Myanmar and Laos establish a framework to regulate migrant workers; however, the program suffers from many problems, including the fact that migrant workers must have identification documents and visas from their country of origin. Many victims of trafficking do not have their paperwork, as discussed *supra*. *Id.* at 847.

⁷⁰ *Id.*

⁷¹ Thailand's Prevention and Suppression of Prostitution Act B.E. 2935 (1996) provides in relevant part: "Any person who, for the purpose of prostitution, solicits, induces, introduces herself or himself to, follows or importunes a person in a street, public place or any other place in an open and shameless manner or causes nuisance to the public, shall be liable to a fine not exceeding one thousand Baht. Any person who associates with another person in a prostitution establishment for the purpose of prostitution of himself or herself or another person shall be liable to imprisonment for a term not exceeding one month or to a fine not exceeding one thousand Baht or to both. If the offence under paragraph one is committed on account of compulsion or under an influence which cannot be avoided or resisted, the offender is not guilty." (Articles 5 and 6). Available at, <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/WEBTEXT/46403/65063/E96THA01.htm>.

The international human rights legal perspective emphasizes recognition that victims of forced human trafficking in the sex industry are exploited in violation of their human rights and against their will; the perpetrators of criminal trafficking violate international laws subject to prosecution. Thus, viewing the trafficking problem within a demand country from both a human rights perspective and a law enforcement perspective will allow for a fusion that is mutually beneficial to the fight against trafficking. This is especially important because often law enforcement officials are not trained to recognize victims of sex trafficking as distinct from sex traffickers who exploit victims' vulnerability with impunity. The human rights perspective would urge states to train law enforcement to recognize the difference between involuntarily trafficked women and children from so-called voluntary prostitutes. Victims' human rights can then be the first priority, rather than prosecution and/or detention of the victims. Because unfortunately the Trafficking Protocol does not have a strong human rights perspective, this distinction may be lost on state officials and police officers attempting to enforce laws prohibiting prostitution. Hence, an equal focus on human rights and law enforcement is the best way to combat trafficking and ensure victims' rights are not ignored.

A potentially controversial but progressive approach to protecting victims' human rights in a state like Thailand would be to de-criminalize and regulate prostitution. Human sex trafficking is inextricably linked to prostitution, and hence a state's attitude and legal treatment of prostitution greatly affects the rate of trafficking and how law

enforcement deals with the problem.⁷² There are four ways a state can approach prostitution: prohibition, regulation, abolition, and decriminalization.⁷³

Decriminalization and regulation of prostitution combined with prosecution of criminal sex-trade organizations would be a better approach for the victims of human rights violations. Cultural expectations regard the sex industry as an acceptable male-dominated subjugation of women. Currently figures show that 90% of Southeast Asian men have visited a prostitute at least once, and around 60% regularly visit a prostitute⁷⁴. Recognizing these complex social dynamics will contribute to shifting the legislative emphasis for appropriate laws to legally pursue and prosecute the organized sex-trade crime syndicates and recognize the human rights of the victims of the sex-trade industry.

A state that takes the prohibition approach (e.g. the United States) legally bans all prostitution and prosecutes the prostitutes, the “pimps,” the customers, and to a much lesser extent, the brothel owners. The biggest problem with this approach is that it makes no distinction between voluntary and involuntary sex workers: all are treated as criminals.⁷⁵ Furthermore, in practice it is usually the prostitute who is punished; the traffickers and the brothel owners are rarely prosecuted.⁷⁶

Studies show that women prostitutes are overwhelmingly penalized, while the men who derive profit . . . or pleasure . . . are often exculpated. Class factors operate in this equation as well: male clients are often well-respected, legitimate members of their communities, while female prostitutes are likely to be poor and ostracized by their society as immoral.⁷⁷

⁷² See, Chan, *supra* note 4, at 329; Martti Lehti & Kauko Aromaa, *Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation*, 34 *Crime & Just.* 133 (2006).

⁷³ Lehti & Aromaa, *supra* note 79, at 133.

⁷⁴ According to the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW) 4.6 million Thai men regularly, and 500,000 foreign tourists annually, use prostituted women. See http://www.catwinternational.org/factbook/Asia_Pacific.php.

⁷⁵ Chan, *supra* note 4, at 342.

⁷⁶ *Id.* at 338.

⁷⁷ *Id.*

The Committee on the Discrimination Against Women has “recommended the decriminalization of prostitution in specific countries (such as China) where prostitution and trafficking of women and children are rampant.”⁷⁸ Like China, prostitution and trafficking are rampant in Thailand; the sex trafficking industry has a deep-rooted infrastructure within in the cultural, social and political region.⁷⁹ . However, states that do take this approach seem to have a lower rate of trafficked women and children; this is arguably because traffickers are working within a riskier legal environment.⁸⁰ However, some scholars have also posited the theory that prohibitionist, restrictive approaches to prostitution in Western states have led to rise of men traveling overseas to seek inexpensive prostitutes.⁸¹

Thailand, as well as most other Southeast Asian countries, criminalizes prostitution.⁸² The result, as discussed above, is that involuntary and voluntary sex workers are generally not distinguished; all are “criminals” under the law. This is especially problematic in the Southeast Asian culture because these women and young girls who are involuntary trafficked are stigmatized, deemed morally reprehensible, and sometimes punished under the law. This makes treatment and reintegration extremely difficult. For example, if the victim is repatriated and reintegrated into her homeland, she

⁷⁸ *Id.* at 329.

⁷⁹ *See, Saving the Youngest Workers: The Struggle Against the Southeast Asian Sex Trade*, Harvard International Review, Vol. 26 (3) (Fall 2004), available at <http://www.harvardir.org/articles/1255/>.

⁸⁰ The United States, for example, largely criminalizes prostitution and has a lower amount of trafficked women and children than Southeast Asian states. *See* http://humantrafficking.org/countries/united_states_of_america (source: U.S. Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report 2006) (Estimated between 14,500 and 17,500 trafficked persons per year in the U.S.).

⁸¹ Lehti & Aromaa, *supra* note 79, at 136-37.

⁸² Crawford, *supra* note 5, at 829.

is often the subject of ridicule and shame.⁸³ This can too often lead the victim to re-enter the trafficking cycle or return to domestic prostitution, as other opportunities are non-existent.

The movement towards regulation and decriminalization is growing.⁸⁴ A state that takes this approach legally allows for prostitution, but heavily regulates the activity. Because it is regulated, there is less need for underground brothels and operations that use involuntarily trafficked women and children.⁸⁵ Thus, the state draws a distinction between voluntary and involuntary sex workers. Furthermore, any sex work involving minors is forbidden. The rationale behind this approach is that the market can never be eliminated, so prostitution will never go away. If it must go on, the government should not ignore the problem; rather, it should be regulated.⁸⁶ Finally, if victims of trafficking are distinguished from voluntary prostitutes, the state can recognize the human rights of these victims and implement a program to assist them with health, legal, and other problems created by trafficking.

The potential problem with decriminalization is the adverse social affects of a liberalization of the sex market. If prostitution is “normalized” and explicitly advertised (such as in Germany), people will think it is more morally acceptable; some people may not support this approach because they feel all prostitution demoralizes society and keeps women unequal by allowing them to be treated as sexual objects. On the other hand, regulation allows involuntary sex workers to come forward; they are not viewed as

⁸³ See Chan, *supra* note 4; Crawford, *supra* note 5.

⁸⁴ See *Id.*

⁸⁵ If there are legal, government regulated brothels to fulfill the demand for sexual gratification, the demand for unlawful involuntary sex workers will arguably be reduced.

⁸⁶ For example, the Dutch government has enacted a progressive decriminalization and regulation model, hoping that “regulating prostitution will allow sex workers who voluntarily engage in prostitution to enjoy better protection, while giving the government a better way to combat involuntary or forced prostitution.” Chan, *supra* note 4, at 345.

criminals, but as victims. Another benefit to regulation is that prostitutes will have access to better medical care and preventative measures, such as the legally required use of condoms. For example, a recent policy in Cambodia and Thailand requiring use of condoms in commercial sex has been successful in preventing the spread of STDs, especially HIV/AIDS; a program like this would be even more effective if prostitution were decriminalized and regulated. In this system, a brothel in violation of health regulations (such as required use of condoms) would be subject to government warnings or closure. Additionally, when the industry is regulated, sex workers and the state reap the economic benefits, rather than criminal syndicates.

An integration of the above approaches could prove to be a useful model for Thailand: decriminalize prostitution but treat sex workers as victims. Thus, instead of prosecuting the involuntary sex workers, law enforcement would be required to press charges against the brothel owners and traffickers. This model would encourage sex workers to come forward and report the crime without fear of being criminalized; they would also have access to government aid and assistance. It would also allow for traffickers to be found and prosecuted, which in turn would ultimately deter future traffickers.

Therefore, Thailand can more effectively combat trafficking by taking steps to integrate a victim-centered human rights framework within the law-enforcement based framework in the areas of training police, developing more humanitarian immigration policies, and decriminalizing and regulating prostitution.

V. CONCLUSION

The challenging legal problems faced by the governments of Thailand and Cambodia are integrally connected to the larger global transnational sex trafficking industry, but they also provide an opportunity to clearly apply and implement international human rights laws that can protect victims with unmistakable humanity in the face of morally reprehensible criminal activities. The specific solutions also have a potentially broader scope, and can be applied to other nations with similar cultural and socio-economic factors. The need for a victim centered perspective with an emphasis on international human rights in confronting the entrenched complex law enforcement problem of human trafficking and sex slavery serves the governments in identifying the perpetrators of these crimes while protecting the victims' human rights to freedom from forced sexual slavery, exploitation and degrading discrimination. Law enforcement agencies and administrators can regain a focus on the causes of widespread social problems such as the sex trade industry by decriminalizing those persons forced against their wills into the shadow world of sex workers, distinguishing them from criminal activities as people deserving of rescue and humanitarian aid rather than increasing their misery by prosecution, deportation and socio-cultural ostracism within their societies. In the age of globalization we can see that international human rights laws potentially impact millions of women and children's lives by recognizing their conditions and violations of their rights, while focusing on the socially entrenched causes of large scale human degradation. We can see that the multi-billion dollar trade in human trafficking has caused an expanding slave trade greater than all of the slavery in human history, which must be clearly recognized and dealt with to avoid further perpetuating social

catastrophes within struggling nations. We can see that law enforcement agencies at every level can be educated to identify the transnational criminal elements and their organizations separated from their enslaved victims, so that the perpetrators can be identified and prosecuted. Working within a human rights infused law-enforcement framework will also allow precious government resources to be directed at the real criminals rather than the victims. When governments and the United Nations and NGOs collaborate and share information and resources, and with so many international treaties and laws emerging to combat the international sex trafficking industry, there is still potential for this global violation of human rights to be confronted by an even greater moral and legal force to liberate these victims. As the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Executive Director Antonio Maria Costa stated:

One thing is certain: the next steps we take will be taken together. Under a common banner, we have a better chance of controlling this crime, reaching those who are vulnerable, those who are still suffering, those few who have survived, and all those who want to help. Our message should be: you are not alone.ⁱ

The world community of nations must begin the process of restoring human dignity and cultural integrity to these vulnerable individuals whose human rights are so viciously violated. Human trafficking is a global scourge that must be stopped with urgent victim-centered international human rights laws implemented and action taken to restore the full humanity of people exploited for sex slavery. This is one of the great challenges facing our civilization in the construction of a truly international community of global citizens.

ⁱ *Human Trafficking: A Crime that Shames Us All*, Vienna Forum to Fight Human Trafficking (February 13, 2008), <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/about-unodc/speeches/2008-02-13.html>.